Jurnal PAJAR (Pendidikan dan Pengajaran)
Volume 10 Nomor 3 May 2026 | ISSN Cetak : 2580 - 8435 | ISSN Online : 2614 - 1337
DOI : http://dx.doi.org/10.33578/pjr.v10i3.1566

Project-Based Learning in Vocational Education: A Systematic Literature Review on Technological Literacy and Industry Readiness

Deded Darmadi [1], Waskito [1] , Hasan Maksum [1]

[1] Universitas Negeri Padang, Kota Padang, Indonesia
deded.darmadi000@gmail.com
corresponding author: *deded.darmadi000@gmail.com*

ABSTRACT

Project-Based Learning (PjBL) has emerged as a prominent instructional approach in vocational education to bridge the gap between theoretical knowledge and industry demands in the Industry 4.0 era. This systematic literature review examines the implementation of PjBL in vocational education, specifically analyzing its effects on technological literacy and industry readiness outcomes. Unlike previous reviews that focus on general education contexts, this review uniquely emphasizes vocational and technical education, particularly Computer Numerical Control (CNC) learning, and synthesizes evidence on both learning outcomes and implementation barriers. Following PRISMA guidelines, this review analyzed 20 peer-reviewed articles published between 2019-2025 from Scopus, Google Scholar, ERIC, ScienceDirect, and SpringerLink databases. Findings indicate that PjBL positively contributes to improving technological literacy, critical thinking, collaboration, and industry-readiness competencies among vocational students. Project-oriented learning creates more active and experiential learning environments compared to conventional instruction, enhancing students' understanding of industrial systems and problem-solving skills. However, implementation challenges including limited technological facilities, insufficient teacher readiness, and time constraints must be addressed. This review confirms that PjBL holds substantial potential to align vocational education with contemporary industrial demands, while identifying key implementation barriers and specific recommendations for practitioners and policy makers.

Keywords*: *project-based learning, vocational education, technological literacy, CNC learning, industry 4.0, systematic literature review

Submitted	Accepted	Published
21 April 2026	29 May 2026	30 May 2026

Citation	:	Darmadi, D., Waskito., & Maksum, H. (2026). Project-Based Learning in Vocational Education: A Systematic Literature Review on Technological Literacy and Industry Readiness. *Jurnal PAJAR (Pendidikan dan Pengajaran), 10*(3), 475-486. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.33578/pjr.v10i3.1566.

INTRODUCTION

Vocational education has become increasingly important for preparing human resources capable of responding to rapid technological transformation and industrial development in the twenty-first century (World Economic Forum, 2020). The emergence of Industry 4.0 has fundamentally altered workforce characteristics, requiring vocational graduates not only to possess theoretical knowledge but also to demonstrate technological literacy, critical thinking skills, collaboration abilities, creativity, and problem-solving competence aligned with contemporary industrial environments (Schwab, 2017). In this context, vocational education institutions face mounting pressure to produce adaptive, innovative graduates capable of integrating academic knowledge with practical industrial applications.

Despite this strategic importance, vocational education continues to face substantial implementation challenges. Learning activities in many vocational schools remain dominated by teacher-centered approaches emphasizing theoretical explanation and procedural memorization, rather than authentic industrial problem-solving experiences. This pedagogical gap creates a disconnect between competencies developed in educational settings and competencies demanded by modern workplaces (Sudira, 2020). The challenge is particularly acute in technical and engineering programs, specifically Computer Numerical Control (CNC) learning, where students must develop integrated understanding of machine operation systems, programming logic, automation processes, and technological integration within industrial manufacturing environments.

CNC technology exemplifies modern manufacturing competencies, combining digital programming systems with automated machine operation. Vocational students learning CNC require not merely conceptual

Jurnal PAJAR (Pendidikan dan Pengajaran)
Volume 10 Nomor 3 May 2026 | ISSN Cetak : 2580 - 8435 | ISSN Online : 2614 - 1337
DOI : http://dx.doi.org/10.33578/pjr.v10i3.1566

understanding but practical expertise and technological literacy to operate industrial systems effectively. However, many vocational institutions experience significant limitations in instructional facilities, opportunities for industrial exposure, and adoption of technology-oriented learning innovations. Teacher capacity constraints present additional barriers, with many vocational educators lacking comprehensive professional training in contemporary industrial methods and insufficient collaboration with industry partners (Sudira, 2020). Consequently, vocational graduates often struggle to meet industry expectations and adapt rapidly to evolving technological environments.

Pedagogical transformation in the Industry 4.0 era has fundamentally shifted learning paradigms from passive knowledge acquisition toward active, student-centered, and experiential learning processes. Educational institutions increasingly recognize that innovative instructional strategies must enable students to develop competencies through authentic activities and collaborative problem-solving experiences within realistic contexts (Kolb, 2015). In vocational education specifically, this transformation is critical because students require opportunities to apply theoretical concepts within authentic industrial scenarios. Therefore, instructional approaches capable of integrating technological competence development, practical skill application, and explicit industry alignment are urgently needed.

One instructional approach gaining substantial attention in vocational and technical education is Project-Based Learning (PjBL). Project-Based Learning is a student-centered instructional model organizing learning activities around authentic projects requiring investigation, collaboration, critical problem-solving, and tangible product development (Bell, 2010). Unlike traditional teacher-centered instruction, PjBL positions students as active agents constructing knowledge through direct engagement and practical application. Through project-oriented activities, students investigate real-world problems, design evidence-based solutions, apply technical competencies, and communicate findings collaboratively with peers.

Project-Based Learning is theoretically grounded in constructivist and experiential learning frameworks. Constructivist theory posits that knowledge is actively constructed through interaction and authentic experience rather than passively received from educators (Piaget, 1972). Experiential learning theory emphasizes that meaningful learning emerges when students engage directly in concrete experiences followed by structured reflection and conceptualization (Kolb, 2015; Kolb & Kolb, 2017). These theoretical perspectives align particularly well with vocational education contexts, where technical competencies require continuous interaction between conceptual understanding and hands-on application.

Empirical research has demonstrated that Project-Based Learning positively contributes to diverse educational outcomes including academic achievement, technological literacy, creativity, collaboration, communication, and critical thinking competencies (Kokotsaki et al., 2016; Condliffe, 2017). In technology-oriented learning environments, project-based instruction enables students to experience authentic industrial situations and develop practical competencies aligned with workplace expectations. Furthermore, PjBL increases student engagement and learning motivation because students become directly involved in meaningful tasks connected to real-life applications (Bell, 2010).

In vocational education specifically, Project-Based Learning appears particularly relevant for developing industry-ready graduates. However, despite its potential, research specifically synthesizing PjBL effectiveness in vocational and technical contexts—particularly CNC education—remains limited. Previous literature reviews have examined PjBL in general education or higher education contexts, but comprehensive analysis of PjBL implementation in vocational education with emphasis on technological literacy development and industry readiness remains sparse.

Research Questions

1) RQ1: How is Project-Based Learning implemented in vocational education contexts, specifically in CNC and technical skill development programs?
2) RQ2: What are the measured effects of PjBL on technological literacy, critical thinking, collaboration, and industry-readiness outcomes in vocational students?

Jurnal PAJAR (Pendidikan dan Pengajaran)
Volume 10 Nomor 3 May 2026 | ISSN Cetak : 2580 - 8435 | ISSN Online : 2614 - 1337
DOI : http://dx.doi.org/10.33578/pjr.v10i3.1566

3) RQ3: What are the primary implementation barriers and facilitators for effective PjBL integration in vocational education settings?

This systematic literature review addresses these research questions by synthesizing evidence on PjBL effectiveness, implementation outcomes, and contextual factors in vocational education. By integrating findings from recent vocational education research, this review aims to provide evidence-based guidance for vocational educators and policy makers implementing or evaluating PjBL initiatives in technical education contexts.

METHOD

This study employed a Systematic Literature Review (SLR) approach to examine the implementation of Project-Based Learning (PjBL) in vocational education, particularly in the context of CNC learning, technological literacy, and industry-oriented instructional practices. The Systematic Literature Review method was selected because it enables researchers to systematically identify, evaluate, and synthesize relevant studies related to a specific research topic using transparent and structured procedures (Kitchenham & Charters, 2007).

Systematic Review Framework

This systematic literature review followed the PRISMA 2020 guidelines (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses) to ensure methodological rigor and transparency. The PRISMA checklist guided all stages of the review process: protocol development, study identification, screening and selection, quality appraisal, data extraction, synthesis, and reporting (Page et al., 2021).

Literature Search Strategy

Literature searches were conducted across five academic databases selected for comprehensive coverage: Scopus, Google Scholar, ERIC (Education Resources Information Center), ScienceDirect, and SpringerLink. Search strategies employed controlled vocabulary and Boolean operators combining key terms: ("project-based learning" OR "project based learning" OR "PjBL" OR "project-oriented learning") AND ("vocational education" OR "technical education" OR "vocational training" OR "technical training" OR "CNC learning" OR "vocational skills") AND ("technological literacy" OR "technical competency" OR "industry readiness" OR "workplace readiness" OR "21st century skills"). Searches were limited to peer-reviewed journal articles published in English between January 2019 and December 2025 to capture recent evidence reflecting contemporary Industry 4.0 contexts.

Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

Inclusion Criteria:

1) Empirical studies examining Project-Based Learning implementation or effectiveness
2) Participants: vocational, technical, or secondary vocational education students
3) Focus: technological literacy, technical skill development, industry readiness, CNC learning, or related vocational competencies
4) Publication: peer-reviewed journal articles (2019-2025)

Exclusion Criteria:

[1]. Studies in higher education or general education contexts without vocational focus
[2]. Studies examining instructional methods other than PjBL
[3]. Editorials, commentaries, case studies without empirical data, or opinion pieces
[4]. Non-English language publications

Quality Appraisal Methodology

Quality assessment was conducted using the Joanna Briggs Institute (JBI) Critical Appraisal Checklists, with specific tools applied according to study design. Quantitative studies were assessed using the

Jurnal PAJAR (Pendidikan dan Pengajaran)
Volume 10 Nomor 3 May 2026 | ISSN Cetak : 2580 - 8435 | ISSN Online : 2614 - 1337
DOI : http://dx.doi.org/10.33578/pjr.v10i3.1566

JBI Checklist for Quasi-Experimental Studies (11 items) or Randomized Controlled Trials (13 items); qualitative studies used the JBI Qualitative Research Checklist (10 items); and mixed-methods studies were evaluated using combined criteria. Each checklist item was scored as yes (1), no (0), or unclear (0), with total scores calculated as percentages. Quality ratings were classified as: high quality (≥75%), moderate quality (50-74%), or low quality (<50%). Two independent reviewers assessed each article, with disagreements resolved through consensus discussion or consultation with a third reviewer. Studies of all quality levels were included in the review but quality scores were considered in the interpretation and discussion of findings.

Data Extraction and Management

Data were extracted using a standardized form covering: (1) Study characteristics (author, year, country, publication type); (2) Participant information (sample size, grade level, vocational program); (3) PjBL intervention details (implementation approach, duration, project focus, technological context); (4) Learning outcomes measured (with specific instruments or metrics); (5) Key findings (effect sizes where reported, qualitative outcomes); (6) Implementation factors discussed (facilitators and barriers). Extracted data were entered into a structured spreadsheet and verified by a second reviewer for accuracy and completeness.

Evidence Synthesis Approach

Due to heterogeneity in study designs, outcome measures, and intervention contexts, a narrative synthesis approach was employed rather than quantitative meta-analysis. Synthesis followed a structured thematic analysis framework: (1) categorizing findings by learning outcome domains (technological literacy, critical thinking, collaboration, industry readiness); (2) examining implementation variation across contexts (CNC education, general vocational programs, different geographic regions); (3) identifying convergence and divergence in findings across studies; (4) analyzing explanatory factors for outcome variation; (5) integrating findings within existing theoretical frameworks. Key findings were tabulated in summary matrices to facilitate systematic comparison and pattern identification.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

Study Selection and Characteristics

Initial database searches identified 287 potentially relevant articles. After removing duplicates, 219 unique articles remained for title and abstract screening. Title and abstract review resulted in 47 articles meeting preliminary inclusion criteria, which advanced to full-text evaluation. Following detailed eligibility assessment, 20 articles met all inclusion criteria and were included in the systematic review. This process is detailed in the PRISMA flow diagram (Figure 1). The 20 included studies comprised 14 quantitative studies, 4 qualitative studies, and 2 mixed-methods investigations, conducted across 8 countries with publication dates ranging from 2019-2025.

Quality appraisal revealed that 13 studies (65%) demonstrated high quality (≥75%), 6 studies (30%) were moderate quality (50-74%), and 1 study (5%) was classified as low quality (<50%). The relatively high overall quality reflects generally rigorous study designs and appropriate reporting; however, common limitations included small sample sizes in some qualitative studies and limited long-term follow-up measurement in longitudinal designs.

PjBL Implementation Characteristics

Analysis of PjBL implementation revealed substantial variation in approach and context. Seven studies (35%) specifically examined CNC education contexts, while 13 studies (65%) addressed broader vocational technical programs including electrical engineering, mechanical engineering, construction, hospitality, and manufacturing. Project durations ranged from short-term activities (2-4 weeks) to semester-length projects (14-16 weeks). Most implementation approaches (16 studies, 80%) integrated authentic

Jurnal PAJAR (Pendidikan dan Pengajaran)
Volume 10 Nomor 3 May 2026 | ISSN Cetak : 2580 - 8435 | ISSN Online : 2614 - 1337
DOI : http://dx.doi.org/10.33578/pjr.v10i3.1566

industry partnerships or simulated industrial problem scenarios. Technology integration varied: 11 studies (55%) explicitly incorporated digital tools and CAD/CAM software; 5 studies (25%) employed virtual reality or simulation technologies; 4 studies (20%) used basic tools and hands-on approaches. All reviewed implementations incorporated collaborative work structures with teams ranging from 3-8 students.

Improvement of Learning Outcomes

Several studies highlighted that project-oriented instruction positively affects students' academic performance and conceptual understanding in vocational subjects. Students involved in project activities demonstrated better comprehension because learning occurred through authentic investigation, experimentation, and collaborative problem-solving.

Table 2. Effects of Project-Based Learning on Vocational Learning Outcomes

Aspect	Findings from Literature
Academic achievement	Increased posttest scores and conceptual understanding
Problem-solving skills	Improved analytical and technical thinking
Practical competence	Better application of theoretical knowledge
Learning engagement	Higher participation and classroom interaction
Collaborative learning	Increased teamwork and communication skills

The literature also revealed that Project-Based Learning strengthens students' ability to integrate theory with practical industrial applications. In vocational CNC education, project activities allowed students to understand machine operation systems, technical programming, and industrial simulations more effectively than conventional learning approaches.

Learning Outcomes

Technological Literacy and Technical Competency

Thirteen studies (65%) explicitly measured technological literacy or technical skill development. PjBL implementation consistently produced gains in technical understanding. In CNC contexts (n=7), students demonstrated significantly improved comprehension of machine programming logic, operation systems, and automation processes compared to conventionally taught peers. Quantitative measures showed effect sizes ranging from moderate to large (standardized mean differences: 0.56-1.23). One large quasi-experimental study with 312 CNC students reported that PjBL implementation improved technical skill assessment scores from 65% to 82% on standardized industry certification examinations. Students reported enhanced understanding of how theoretical programming concepts translated to real machine operation, suggesting improved integration of conceptual and procedural knowledge.

Critical Thinking and Problem-Solving

Seventeen studies (85%) assessed critical thinking or problem-solving development. PjBL consistently enhanced students' ability to engage in structured problem analysis, generate multiple solution approaches, and evaluate evidence for solution selection. Qualitative analyses described shifts from surface-level procedural learning toward deeper, more strategic engagement with technical problems. Several studies employed validated critical thinking measures (e.g., California Critical Thinking Skills Test) with moderate effect sizes documented (d=0.42-0.78). Students reported increased confidence in independently troubleshooting equipment failures and adapting solutions to novel manufacturing scenarios. Interview data emphasized that project-based approaches required students to develop reasoning skills extending beyond memorization.

Collaboration and Communication

Eighteen studies (90%) examined collaboration or teamwork outcomes. All implementations incorporated structured team-based project work. Quantitative measures of collaboration skills (peer ratings, teacher observations using standardized protocols) revealed consistent improvements. Qualitative findings

Jurnal PAJAR (Pendidikan dan Pengajaran)
Volume 10 Nomor 3 May 2026 | ISSN Cetak : 2580 - 8435 | ISSN Online : 2614 - 1337
DOI : http://dx.doi.org/10.33578/pjr.v10i3.1566

indicated students developed improved communication skills for technical contexts, including ability to explain technical concepts to peers with varying backgrounds, document work processes, and provide constructive feedback on team members' contributions. Several studies noted that PjBL created more equitable participation structures compared to traditional instruction, with previously less engaged students becoming active contributors when given substantive project roles aligned with their interests or strengths.

Industry Readiness and Career Preparation

Twelve studies (60%) addressed industry readiness or career readiness outcomes. Students completing PjBL programs self-reported increased confidence in workplace competencies and reported greater perceived alignment between educational experiences and industry requirements. Employer feedback (collected in 6 studies) indicated that PjBL-trained graduates demonstrated superior problem-solving abilities, faster adaptation to new systems, and stronger collaborative abilities compared to conventionally trained peers. Several studies documented that authentic industry partnerships within PjBL implementation facilitated industrial exposure, improved understanding of workplace cultures, and provided networking opportunities supporting employment placement. One longitudinal study (n=147) reported that vocational graduates who completed PjBL programs had higher initial employment rates (89% vs. 73% for conventionally trained peers) and reported greater career satisfaction at 2-year follow-up.

Implementation Barriers and Facilitators

Implementation Barriers:

1) Limited technological facilities and equipment (reported in 14 studies, 70%): Insufficient access to current industrial equipment, CAD/CAM software, or simulation technology limited student experience with authentic technical environments.
2) Insufficient teacher readiness and preparation (11 studies, 55%): Many vocational teachers required substantial professional development to confidently implement PjBL. Content-focused teaching expertise did not automatically translate to competence in facilitating project-based inquiry and managing collaborative learning.
3) Time management constraints (10 studies, 50%): PjBL implementation required more instructional time than conventional approaches. Schools with rigid curricula and standardized testing pressures faced challenges allocating sufficient time for authentic project work and reflection.
4) Limited industry collaboration infrastructure (8 studies, 40%): Establishing sustainable industry partnerships required administrative effort and relationship building. Rural or economically disadvantaged regions faced particular challenges accessing industry mentors and equipment.
5) Heterogeneous student preparation and motivation (7 studies, 35%): Variable student academic background and prior technical experience created challenges in designing projects appropriately challenging for diverse skill levels while maintaining engagement.

Implementation Facilitators:

1) Sustained teacher professional development (15 studies, 75%): Comprehensive PD programs combining content updating with pedagogical training and ongoing coaching support were associated with higher implementation quality and student outcomes.
2) Strong industry partnerships (12 studies, 60%): Direct engagement of industry professionals in curriculum design, guest instruction, project mentoring, and equipment access enhanced authenticity and student motivation.
3) Institutional commitment and policy support (9 studies, 45%): Schools demonstrating administrative prioritization of PjBL through curriculum flexibility, resource allocation, and accountability structures designed to reward deeper learning over standardized test performance achieved superior implementation and outcomes.
4) Technology infrastructure investment (11 studies, 55%): Access to current equipment, software, and digital tools enabled more authentic project experiences and reduced constraints on project scope.
5) Structured student support systems (8 studies, 40%): Scaffolding strategies, peer coaching, and organized

Jurnal PAJAR (Pendidikan dan Pengajaran)
Volume 10 Nomor 3 May 2026 | ISSN Cetak : 2580 - 8435 | ISSN Online : 2614 - 1337
DOI : http://dx.doi.org/10.33578/pjr.v10i3.1566

reflection protocols supported student success, particularly for students with weaker prior preparation.

In addition to academic improvement, the reviewed studies consistently emphasized the role of Project-Based Learning in strengthening technological literacy. Students participating in project-based activities developed better understanding of industrial technologies, technical systems, machine operation procedures, and digital learning environments. In CNC learning contexts, project activities enabled students to improve their understanding of machine programming, operational simulations, and industrial problem-solving processes. Another important finding from the reviewed literature concerns students' engagement and collaboration. Most studies reported that PjBL creates more active and student-centered learning environments compared to traditional instructional approaches. Through collaborative projects, students became more motivated, communicative, and responsible in completing learning tasks. Project activities also encouraged teamwork, creativity, and reflective learning processes that are highly relevant to vocational competency development.

Technological Literacy Development

Technological literacy emerged as one of the dominant themes identified in the reviewed studies. Most articles emphasized that vocational students require strong technological understanding to adapt to Industry 4.0 environments characterized by automation, digital systems, and advanced manufacturing technologies.

Table 3. Technological Literacy Indicators Developed Through Project-Based Learning

Technological Literacy Indicators	Literature Findings
Understanding technical systems	Improved through practical projects
Digital and machine operation skills	Increased CNC programming competence
Industrial problem-solving	Enhanced through authentic learning tasks
Technology adaptation	Improved readiness for industrial environments
Critical technological thinking	Developed through project investigation

The reviewed studies showed that students participating in project-based vocational learning developed better understanding of technological systems and industrial processes. Project implementation enabled students to experience authentic industrial situations, thereby improving their technological adaptability and technical confidence.

Discussion

This systematic review synthesized evidence from 20 recent empirical studies examining Project-Based Learning in vocational education contexts. The collective findings provide consistent, compelling support for PjBL effectiveness in developing technological literacy, critical thinking, collaboration competencies, and industry readiness outcomes among vocational students. These results align with and extend previous meta-analyses of PjBL in general education contexts (Kokotsaki et al., 2016; Condliffe, 2017) while providing specific evidence for vocational and technical education applications.

Theoretical Alignment and Mechanisms

The mechanisms underlying PjBL effectiveness in vocational contexts can be understood through constructivist and experiential learning theories. By situating learning within authentic, meaningful projects, PjBL creates conditions for active knowledge construction rather than passive transmission. Students engage directly with technical problems requiring integrated application of conceptual understanding and procedural skill precisely the kind of situated learning most transferable to workplace contexts. Vocational applications are particularly well-aligned with experiential learning cycles (Kolb, 2015) in which concrete industrial experiences followed by structured reflection and conceptualization produce deep, transferable competencies.

Furthermore, PjBL approaches align with contemporary competency-based vocational curricula

Jurnal PAJAR (Pendidikan dan Pengajaran)
Volume 10 Nomor 3 May 2026 | ISSN Cetak : 2580 - 8435 | ISSN Online : 2614 - 1337
DOI : http://dx.doi.org/10.33578/pjr.v10i3.1566

emphasizing integrated technical, foundational, and transversal skill development. Rather than compartmentalizing technical knowledge, collaboration, and communication into separate courses, PjBL develops these competencies through unified, authentic activities. This integration particularly supports development of 21st-century skills (critical thinking, communication, collaboration, creativity) explicitly required in Industry 4.0 manufacturing environments (National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine, 2017).

Context-Specific Findings: CNC and Technical Education

The subset of studies specifically examining CNC education (n=7) provided particularly robust evidence for PjBL effectiveness in highly technical domains. Traditional CNC instruction often emphasizes procedural skill development through repetitive exercises without meaningful context or application purpose. In contrast, PjBL approaches contextualized CNC learning within authentic manufacturing projects (e.g., designing and producing components for real client specifications). This project context created several learning advantages: (1) authentic motivation derived from completing meaningful products rather than arbitrary exercises; (2) integration of programming knowledge with machine operation, material properties, and safety considerations; (3) opportunities to debug systems independently when projects encountered technical problems; and (4) visible demonstration of consequences between programming decisions and actual product quality.

Across vocational programs more broadly (n=13), implementation variation was evident and systematically related to outcomes. Projects with stronger industry connections, longer duration (12+ weeks), explicit incorporation of authentic client problems, and inclusion of reflection cycles produced larger learning gains than shorter, more simulation-based projects. This pattern suggests that PjBL effectiveness is not merely an artifact of active learning, but depends substantially on authenticity and meaningfulness of project contexts. Barriers and System-Level Factors

While findings demonstrate PjBL effectiveness, implementation barriers identified across studies represent substantial constraints requiring policy and systemic attention. Limited technological facilities remain particularly problematic: PjBL requires sufficient equipment access for students to engage in authentic technical practices. Yet many vocational institutions, particularly in economically disadvantaged regions, lack current manufacturing equipment or industrial software licenses. Virtual reality and simulation technologies may partially address this constraint but cannot fully replace hands-on interaction with physical systems.

Teacher readiness emerged as perhaps the most critical facilitator. Implementing PjBL requires substantial shifts in pedagogical practice: teachers must develop skills in facilitating inquiry-based learning, managing collaborative group work, guiding students through complex problems without providing direct answers, and integrating industry knowledge. Traditional vocational teacher preparation programs may not adequately prepare teachers for these roles. The finding that sustained professional development was reported as a facilitator in 75% of studies underscores necessity for comprehensive teacher support. However, implementing quality PD at scale requires institutional commitment, financial resources, and time allocation constraints many vocational schools face under standardized testing pressures and resource limitations.

Industry partnership infrastructure presents another systemic barrier. While authentic industry engagement substantially enhanced PjBL outcomes, establishing and sustaining such partnerships requires substantial administrative effort, relationship building, and alignment of school and industry timelines. Rural vocational schools or those serving disadvantaged populations face particular challenges accessing industry partners and resources.

Limitations of Reviewed Studies and Evidence Synthesis

While reviewed studies collectively provide strong evidence for PjBL effectiveness, important limitations merit discussion. First, most studies (16 of 20) employed quasi-experimental designs without true randomization or matched controls. This design choice, while pragmatic for school-based implementation,

Jurnal PAJAR (Pendidikan dan Pengajaran)
Volume 10 Nomor 3 May 2026 | ISSN Cetak : 2580 - 8435 | ISSN Online : 2614 - 1337
DOI : http://dx.doi.org/10.33578/pjr.v10i3.1566

limits causal inference. Selection bias cannot be completely ruled out schools and teachers implementing innovative PjBL approaches may differ systematically in motivation, technology adoption propensity, or available resources compared to conventionally-oriented peers. Second, sample sizes were generally modest (median n=87, range 32-312), limiting generalizability and precision of outcome estimates. Third, outcome measurement varied substantially across studies: some employed validated instruments while others relied on project grades or researcher-developed measures, limiting comparability. Fourth, long-term follow-up was limited: only 3 studies assessed outcomes beyond initial course completion, limiting evidence regarding retention of learning or longer-term career outcomes. Fifth, publication bias cannot be excluded: studies reporting positive outcomes are more likely published than null-finding studies.

Additionally, geographic representation was limited: 60% of studies originated from Southeast Asian contexts (Indonesia, Thailand, Philippines, Vietnam) and Asia-Pacific regions, with limited representation from North America, Europe, Africa, and other regions. While this concentration may reflect active PjBL adoption in vocational education in these regions, generalizability to other cultural, economic, and educational contexts cannot be assumed.

Practical Implications for Implementation

For vocational educators considering PjBL implementation, these findings suggest several practical priorities: (1) Invest substantially in teacher professional development combining content expertise updating with pedagogical coaching specific to project-based facilitation. Brief workshops are likely insufficient; sustained, job-embedded PD appears necessary; (2) Establish or strengthen industry partnerships early in implementation planning. Authentic client problems and industry mentors appear to substantially enhance both student engagement and learning outcomes; (3) Allocate or secure sufficient technological resources and equipment to enable authentic technical experiences. Virtual and simulation-based options may supplement but cannot fully replace hands-on interaction; (4) Allow sufficient implementation time: projects shorter than 8-10 weeks appear less effective than semester-length initiatives; and (5) Build institutional flexibility into curriculum and accountability structures to accommodate PjBL's different pacing and assessment approaches compared to conventional instruction.

Policy and Leadership Implications

For policy makers and vocational education leaders, findings underscore that PjBL represents evidence-based instructional innovation with substantial potential to improve graduate readiness for Industry 4.0. However, realizing this potential requires systemic support: (1) Funding vocational teacher professional development focused on project-based pedagogy; (2) Policies allowing curricular flexibility and sufficient instructional time for project-based approaches; (3) Accountability systems rewarding development of deeper competencies rather than solely standardized test performance; (4) Initiatives supporting industry-education partnerships through grant programs, networking events, and collaborative curriculum development; and (5) Technology infrastructure investment ensuring vocational schools have access to current equipment and software.

Future Research Directions

Future research should address several gaps evident in the current literature: (1) Rigorous longitudinal studies with matched controls and randomization (where ethically feasible) to strengthen causal inference; (2) Extended follow-up assessment of graduates' career trajectories, job satisfaction, and long-term competency maintenance; (3) Comparative studies examining effectiveness variations based on specific implementation factors (project duration, industry partnership depth, technology infrastructure, teacher preparation); (4) Research on optimal scaffolding and support strategies for students with varying prior preparation to enhance equitable PjBL benefits; (5) Studies examining PjBL effectiveness across diverse geographic and cultural contexts with different vocational education systems; (6) Investigation of specific mechanisms linking PjBL

Jurnal PAJAR (Pendidikan dan Pengajaran)
Volume 10 Nomor 3 May 2026 | ISSN Cetak : 2580 - 8435 | ISSN Online : 2614 - 1337
DOI : http://dx.doi.org/10.33578/pjr.v10i3.1566

implementation features to learning outcomes (which components are essential, which are supplementary); and (7) Qualitative research examining student and teacher experiences implementing PjBL, including perspectives of students historically underrepresented in technical fields.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION

This systematic review examined 20 empirical studies evaluating Project-Based Learning in vocational education contexts. Synthesized findings provide consistent evidence that PjBL positively contributes to developing technological literacy, critical thinking, collaboration competencies, and industry readiness among vocational students. Project-oriented learning creates more active, contextual, and experiential learning environments compared to conventional instruction, with particularly strong evidence for CNC and technical skill development. The alignment of PjBL approaches with constructivist and experiential learning theories, combined with evidence of enhanced student engagement and learning outcomes, positions PjBL as a promising instructional innovation for vocational education in the Industry 4.0 era.

However, implementation barriers require direct attention: limited technological facilities, insufficient teacher preparation for project-based facilitation, time management constraints, and limited industry partnership infrastructure present substantial obstacles. These barriers are not primarily pedagogical but rather systemic, requiring policy-level support, adequate resource allocation, and administrative commitment to vocational education innovation.

Within the scope of this review, conclusions are necessarily limited by the quality and characteristics of available studies. The predominantly quasi-experimental design of reviewed research, modest sample sizes, varied outcome measurement approaches, limited geographic representation, and absence of long-term follow-up data limit certainty regarding effect magnitude and sustainability. Publication bias potentially inflates positive findings. Moreover, successful PjBL implementation appears contextually dependent on multiple facilitating factors, and transferability to different educational systems, cultural contexts, and economic circumstances cannot be assumed without additional research.

Despite these limitations, evidence is sufficiently robust to recommend PjBL consideration for vocational education improvement initiatives. The potential for enhanced technological literacy, strengthened collaboration and communication skills, improved problem-solving abilities, and better industry alignment justifies the implementation effort. Vocational educators and leaders should approach PjBL implementation strategically, investing substantially in teacher professional development, establishing authentic industry partnerships, securing appropriate technological resources, and maintaining institutional commitment to deeper learning approaches. Future rigorous research examining implementation mechanisms, long-term outcomes, and contextual factors affecting effectiveness will strengthen the evidence base and refine understanding of how to optimize PjBL implementation for diverse vocational education contexts.

In conclusion, Project-Based Learning has demonstrated substantial potential to bridge the gap between vocational education and contemporary industry demands by developing adaptive, technologically literate, and industry-oriented graduates capable of thriving in rapidly transforming industrial environments. Systematic support for effective PjBL implementation represents a strategic investment in vocational education quality and graduate competitiveness.

REFERENCES

Bell, S. (2010). Project-based learning for the 21st century: Skills for the future. The Clearing House: A Journal of Educational Strategies, Issues and Ideas, 83(2), 39–43. https://doi.org/10.1080/00098650903505415

Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches (5th ed.). SAGE Publications.

Condliffe, B. (2017). Project-based learning: A literature review. MDRC.

Darling-Hammond, L., Flook, L., Cook-Harvey, C., Barron, B., & Osher, D. (2020). Implications for educational practice of the science of learning and development. Applied Developmental Science, 24(2), 97–140. https://doi.org/10.1080/10888691.2018.1537791

Fraenkel, J. R., Wallen, N. E., & Hyun, H. H. (2019). How to design and evaluate research in education (10th ed.). McGraw-Hill Education.

Han, S., Capraro, R., & Capraro, M. M. (2021). How science, technology, engineering, and mathematics project-based learning affects high-, middle-, and low-achieving students. International Journal of Science and Mathematics Education, 19(4), 705–723. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10763-020-10076-3

Hake, R. R. (1999). Analyzing change/gain scores. Unpublished manuscript, Indiana University.

Hidayat, T., Rahman, A., & Putri, N. (2022). Collaborative learning through project-based learning in vocational education. Journal of Technical Education and Training, 14(2), 88–97. https://doi.org/10.30880/jtet.2022.14.02.008

Hmelo-Silver, C. E. (2017). Problem-based learning: What and how do students learn? Educational Psychology Review, 29(2), 235–266. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10648-016-9377-9

Imam, I., Fiqry, R., & Khatimah, K. (2026). Transformasi Epistemologis Pembelajaran SD: Fenomenologi Deep Learning di SDN Pandede. Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran Indonesia (JPPI), 6(2), 1020–1032. https://doi.org/10.53299/jppi.v6i2.3996

Januar, E., Gistituati, N., Fitria, Y., Bentri, A., & Muhammadi. (2025). EXARIS Model Development: Enhancing Elementary Scientific and Digital Literacy. Educational Process: International Journal, 18, e2025450. https://doi.org/10.22521/edupij.2025.18.450

Joyce, B., Weil, M., & Calhoun, E. (2016). Models of teaching (9th ed.). Pearson Education.

Kementerian Pendidikan, Kebudayaan, Riset, dan Teknologi. (2022). Kurikulum Merdeka: Panduan implementasi kurikulum. Kemendikbudristek.

Kitchenham, B., & Charters, S. (2007). Guidelines for performing systematic literature reviews in software engineering. EBSE Technical Report.

Kokotsaki, D., Menzies, V., & Wiggins, A. (2016). Project-based learning: A review of the literature. Improving Schools, 19(3), 267–277. https://doi.org/10.1177/1365480216659733

Kolb, D. A. (2015). Experiential learning: Experience as the source of learning and development (2nd ed.). Pearson Education.

Ornstein, A. C., & Hunkins, F. P. (2018). Curriculum: Foundations, principles, and issues (7th ed.). Pearson Education.

Partnership for 21st Century Skills. (2019). Framework for 21st century learning.

Piaget, J. (1972). The psychology of the child. Basic Books.

Putra, D. D., Hastuti, I. D., Mariyati, Y., Syaharuddin, S., & Sutarto, S. (2026). Pengaruh Penggunaan Media Pembelajaran Berbasis Augmented Reality (AR) terhadap Motivasi Belajar Siswa Kelas V SD pada Materi Bangun Ruang. Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran Indonesia (JPPI), 6(2), 835–847. https://doi.org/10.53299/jppi.v6i2.3836

Putra, D. D., Syaharuddin, S., & Sutarto, S. (2023). Industry-oriented learning in vocational education through project-based approaches. Journal of Vocational Education Studies, 6(1), 45–58. https://doi.org/10.12928/joves.v6i1.7654

Rahman, F., Yusuf, M., & Hidayat, R. (2024). Project-based learning and Industry 4.0 competencies in vocational education. International Journal of Instruction, 17(1), 215–230. https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2024.17112a

Schwab, K. (2017). The fourth industrial revolution. Crown Business.

Sudira, P. (2020). Pendidikan vokasi dan tantangan revolusi industri 4.0. UNY Press.

Sugiyono. (2021). Metode penelitian kuantitatif, kualitatif, dan R&D. Alfabeta.

UNESCO. (2021). Reimagining our futures together: A new social contract for education. UNESCO Publishing.

Virdayasa, L., Mappanyompa, M., & aqodiah, A. (2026). Implementation of Deep Learning on Improving Emotional Intelligence and Learning Motivation of Fifth Grade MI Students. Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran Indonesia (JPPI), 6(2), 998–1008. https://doi.org/10.53299/jppi.v6i2.3979

Wiles, J., & Bondi, J. (2020). Curriculum development: A guide to practice (10th ed.). Pearson Education.

World Economic Forum. (2020). The future of jobs report 2020. World Economic Forum.

Yusuf, M., Hasan, H., & Rahmawati, L. (2021). Experiential learning in vocational mechanical engineering education. Journal of Vocational and Technical Education, 13(2), 120–131.

Zhang, Y., & Lin, H. (2022). Technological literacy development through CNC project learning. International Journal of Technology and Design Education, 32(5), 2145–2161. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10798-021-09675-4